Papua New Guinea Torres Strait tropical rock lobster fishery MSC Fishery Assessment Report Public Certification Report

Authors

Mr. Alexander Morison, Lead and Principle 1 Ms. Jessica Melgey, Principle 2 Dr. Abdul Halim, Principle 3

Client

Fishing Industry Association (PNG) Inc. Donald Papaol, Executive Secretary P.O. Box 1130, Boroko 111 National Capital District, Papua New Guinea

Client Action Plan – Lobster PNG

Performance Indicator	PI 1.2.3 (Scoring issue c) Comprehensiveness of information
Score	60
Justification	Error! Reference source not found.
	Other fishery removals means those outside the UoA. For this fishery, this means the other commercial sectors (TVH and TIB), customary and subsistence catch by indigenous groups, catch by recreational fishers, and bycatch in prawn trawl fisheries.
	Removals by the TVH and TIB sectors are reported regularly to the PZJA and are used by the science provider in the calculation of CPUE indices. These are the largest catches from the stock.
	After the site visit the team were provided with a copy of a report that contained data on the species composition and quantity of catch taken by traditional fisheries in the Torres Strait (Busilacchi et al. 2014). This study included both commercial and subsistence take of lobsters and found that about 85% of the total catch was for the export market with the remainder consumed domestically. This component also included a negligible proportion (<1%) of undersized animals. Although now somewhat dated, this study does provide good

Condition 1-1 PI 1.2.3 – Information and monitoring

	information on these	e removals and provides evidence that the catch levels were small	
	compared to the known commercial catches.		
	No additional information was obtained about the bycatch in prawn trawl fisheries although we were advised that a project involving onboard observers was underway and would report soon. This is potentially a source of unreported mortality and until the results of this study are provided we consider that there remains a gap in the information available on other removals.		
	This does not meet t	he requirements of the SG 80 level.	
Condition	By the fourth surveill fishery removals fror	ance audit provide evidence that there is good information on all other n the stock.	
Condition start	Immediately after th	e certificate is granted	
Condition deadline	Fourth surveillance a	udit.	
Verification with other entities	NFA is the agency that would be able to provide the information necessary to close this condition.		
Milestone	Surveillance (YEAR 1)	: Milestone Year 1	
Year 1	Develop a plan to improve the information available on other removals from the stock.		
	Expected score: 60		
	Activities:	FIA PNG and The National Fisheries Authority (NFA) to evaluate all current sources of information concerning unreported fishing amounts in the Torres Strait Reef (UoA) including:	
Client Action Plan		 Initial desktop review of reports, independent research projects, and consumption surveys. Later NFA design a process aimed to filling gaps in data collection. TRL exporters, and the Fishing Industry Association (FIA PNG) also will search data in this desktop to have a comprehensive research plan for drafting a "data collection plan" (NFA) 	
		 b. Consultation meetings with Daru divers, licensed operators, Villagers, recreational fisheries, and trawlers representatives. This meeting will include: 	
		Send invitation letters to each stakeholder.	
		 Search from primary and second sources (google) of literature for the desktop (a) 	
		• Write a draft a plan to data collection (a + b)	
		 FIA and NFA will coordinate and organise at least one (1) consultation meeting for agreeing in the way forward before sharing a plan. 	

	Expected outcome:	 A comprehensive NFA data collection plan for TRL (DCP – TSRL) – draft Improved frequency of data collection Improved Monitoring and Reporting A Technical Working Group to support the MSC lobster process should be created (TWG). It would be published in the FIA PNG website Evidence by: Meeting minutes (attendance list, photo) emails exchanged with stakholders and TWG members Draft of the initial documented plan for TRL
Milestone Year 2	Surveillance (YEAR 2) Implement the plant stock. Expected score: 60	: Milestone Year 2 to improve the information available on all other removals from the
	Activities:	The DCP – TSRL has initiated with trials and pilots. The FIA PNG TWG and the NFA officers to evaluate preliminary results of data collected and revise the project as necessary. We expect at the annual surveillance audit, NFA and/or FIA PNG (exporters) to present preliminary results of research and data collection
Client Action Plan	Expected outcome:	 A revised NFA data collection plan for TRL Preliminary results and process Photos, forms, reports A report that verifies the level of implementation of the plan for TRL Responsible parties: FIA with NFA
Milestone Year 3	Surveillance (YEAR 3): Milestone Year 3 Review the information obtained from the plan and revise plan if necessary. Expected score: 60	
Client Action Plan	Activities:	Continue pilots, monitoring and improving of the DCP – TSRL. NFA and/or FIA will update the results

	Expected outcome:	 Updated report and results of the DCP – TSRL Evaluation Report of the level of implementation of the plan for TSRL based on the intial trials and data collected NFA and FIA
Milestone Year 4	Surveillance (YEAR 4): Milestone Year 4 Provide evidence that there is now good information available on all other removals from the stock. Expected score: 80	
	Activities:	NFA, TWG, and FIA to complete the final plan and complete any gaps in the data collected. NFA to present results to relevant enforcement and compliance NFA business units and other stakeholders such as the Lobster operators, as well as the Certification Assessment Body (CAB) at the annual surveillance assessment.
Client Action Plan	Expected outcome:	 Evidenced by: Letters of support from NFA in relation to the action plan Consultation meetings (minutes, photos, emails, communication) Final report to demonstrate the control of other removals from the stock NFA and FIA PNG
Consultation on condition	Letters of support fro	om NFA in relation to the action plan

Performance Indicator	PI 3.2.3 (Scoring issue: c) Compliance, PNG System	
Score	70	
Justification	Error! Reference source not found. In PNG, the TRL management measures include: (a) Licensing, (b) Size Limits and Restriction on Egg-bearing Females, (c) Gear Restrictions, (d) Home Reefs, (e) Total Allowable Catch (TAC), (f) Export, and (g) Reporting. Under the licensing measures, licensing conditions are set including among others the prohibition of the taking of turtles and dugongs by licensed vessels and dinghies while fishing for tropical rock lobster. In addition, under the size limit and restriction of egg-bearing female measure, it is prohibited to capture and export undersize TRL with a tail length of less than 115mm and berried (egg-bearing) female. The fishing licensed operator is also required to submit to NFA every 21st day of each month, the catch and effort data on the standard lobster logbook provided by NFA or the operator's record. During the field audit, it was found that the capture of the undersize and berried female lobster is still occurring by the fishers (divers) of the licensed fishing operators. These undersize lobsters are mainly sold in the local market or for the household consumption. In addition, there is anecdotal information that the divers also capture dugongs and turtles during the time of their fishing for lobsters. Lobster fishing mainly take place during low tide, meanwhile dugong and turtles usually surface up in the reefs during high tide.	
Condition	By the fourth surveillance audit, evidence exist to show that fishers have complied with the management system including fishing regulations on the size limit, egg-bearing females and ETP species.	
Condition start	Immediately after the certificate is granted	
Condition deadline	Fourth surveillance audit	
Verification with other entities	N/A	
Milestone Year 1	Surveillance (YEAR 1): Milestone Year 1: Evidence that fishers (divers) and the licensed operators have been informed of the prohibitions to catch and sale undersized and egg-bearing female lobsters as well as the ETP species, such as dugong and turtles. Expected score: 70	
Client Action Plan	Activities:NFA and (CEPA) to assess the ETP swimming in the reef, together with FIA develop material with photos and guidance for awareness to be placed onboard each vessel's platform moored in the reef.Continue to improve dialogue and collaboration between enforcement agencies concerning IUU detection and sanction options, including	nt

Condition 3-1 PI 3.2.3 – Compliance and Enforcement

	Expected outcome:	 consideration of systematic non-compliance risks. Continue efforts to have the revised Fisheries Act finalized which includes measures to increase fines for various aspects of fishery management Develop a series of workshop (education awareness) with divers, and lobster operators to explained them about the importance of ETP in the ocean ecosystem, why should avoid catching and consequences of a non-compliance. Develop a series of workshop with divers, and lobster operators to explained the importance of undersized and egg-bearing female lobsters in the ocean ecosystem, why should avoid catching and consequences of a non-compliance. These programs will be revised, will be established for any diver or Lobster operations, annually assessment of outcomes to increase awareness about fees and non-compliance. Review TRL Management Plan to have conditions for the fishery to include ETP's protection Fishers are trained in the relevant prohibitions to catch and sale undersized and egg-bearing female lobsters as well as the ETP species, such as dugong and turtles Evidenced by: Clipboards to place on board PPT training material for workshop – awareness Workshops (list of attendances, photos, workshop content) NFA legislation for compliance and penalty's fees. A report year # 1 with the non- compliance found during the trial period and recommendation ot avoid the re-ocurrence.
		NFA, TWG, FIA, and CEPA
Milestone Year 2		is presented to the team to prove that divers and fishing operators have e relevant TRL fishery rules and regulations and as a result compliance is
Client Action Plan	Activities:	Continue collaboration between divers and NFA enforcement department, detection and sanction options already in place. Development of a document or agreement to be signed by parties (divers, lobster operators and NFA) on appropriated enforcement and sanctions for non-compliance efforts respecting undersized and egg- bearing female lobsters and ETP. Including the commitment to support the MSC fishery standard requirements and the NFA fishery management plan and penalties.

	Expected outcome:	 Monitoring results from NFA compliance unit – report. On-going enforcement efforts and improvements achieved will be presented to the CAB at the annual surveillance audit. Agreements signed by divers, and operations NFA Compliance report updated including data, Follow up report year # 2 to assess level of compliance against the report of year # 1. NFA, TWG and FIA
Milestone Year 3		nce report is provided to demonstrate compliance with TRL fishery rules that fishers and operators have shared information importance to the
Client Action Plan	Activities:	Evidence that agreed sanctions are being implemented. On-going at- sea enforcement efforts against non-compliance control. Coordination and control both at Sea and landing sites. On-going consultation to discuss options for alignment of regulations, monitoring, sanctions and practice On-going data collection for compliance.
	Expected outcome:	 dCurrent efforts of enforcement will be presented to the Certification Assessment Body (NFA compliance report) Any sanctions raised, documented, and follow up Consultation minutes (photos, attendances, discussion points) Agreement about involved parties to respect and committed to the current fishery management plan Report comparing Year # 1, Year # 2 and Year # 3 progress to terack non-compliance
Milestone Year 4	Surveillance (YEAR 4): Milestone Year 4: By the fourth surveillance audit, evidence exist to show that fishers have complied with the management system including fishing regulations on the size limit, egg-bearing females and ETP species. Expected score: 80	

	Activities:	We will evaluate results and implications of the current NFA compliance and enforcement plan, including three-year assessment and data indicators. NFA and/ or FIA comparison assessment shows improvement compared to baseline data establish in certification year (2023). A management system in place that include NFA compliance report, monitoring program, officers responsible, frequency of monitoring, data collection sheet or electronic reports
Client Action Plan	Expected outcome:	 Signed agreement (divers, lobster operators and NFA) NFA and or FIA annual assessment comparison of non-compliance from 2023 (baseline), 2024 – 2027 Report include the level of compliance or implementation of the management measures ensuring no juveniles and bearing-eggs were captured and other ETP species NFA compliance management system documents NFA and FIA
Consultation on condition		

Performance Indicator	PI 3.2.3 (Scoring issue d) and Systematic non-compliance, PNG System	
Score	70	
Justification	logbook as a mean to and the version that NFA was established Nevertheless, the NF properly filled in by to fishing operators tim Management Plan. T licensed fishing boat evidence of the press admitted that he did required by the com captain to properly fi	arce not found. ery is among the oldest fisheries, that since the early 80s has applied to record the TRL catch. That logbook has gone through several revisions is currently being used was developed in 2002 by the NFA, soon as the and designated as the PNG fishery management authority. EA official recognizes that so far, the logbook has not been regularly and the fishing boat skippers/captains nor submitted by the licensed TRL rely to NFA as required by the measures stipulated in the TRL Fishery this is also confirmed during the field audit when the auditors visited a used as the fishing base at sea, in Otamabu Reef, that there is no ence of logbook onboard of the fishing base. The boat captain also not fill in the required logbook and only fill in the purchase record as pany. The NFA official confirmed that it is the obligation of the boat ill in the logbook at sea. All the above have leaded the auditors to the PNG system, there is a systematic non-compliance in the fishery.
Condition	By the fourth surveillance audit, an updated compliance report is produced to demonstrate improved compliance with reporting regulation, including completion and maintenance of logbooks by the boat captain, first officer or company representative such that there is no evidence of systematic non-compliance.	
Condition start	Immediately after the certificate is granted.	
Condition deadline	Fourth surveillance audit.	
Verification with other entities	N/A	
Milestone Year 1	Surveillance (YEAR 1): Milestone Year 1: Evidence that the fishing operators and vessels owners and their vessels captains, have been informed of the requirement to carry log books, or other reporting methods to comply with NFA reporting requirements, on all vessels and for them to be completed by the Captain or an appointed person by the company and reports provided to the NFA. Expected score: 70	
Client Action Plan	Activities:	NFA to assess the current process of filling log-books and why fishing vessel captains are not filling it, and not reporting it to NFA officers. Together with FIA develop material with photos and guidance step by step for recording, accurate reporting, filling of the logbook in regular basis; and submitting in an agreed period of the data to the NFA

Condition 3-2 PI 3.2.3 – Compliance and Enforcement

	Expected outcome:	 Continue to improve dialogue and collaboration between Lobster's operators, NFA officers and Captains. If necessary; continue efforts to have the revised Fisheries Management Plan finalised which includes measures to increase fines for various aspects of fishery management. Develop a series of workshop (education awareness) with Captains, and lobster operators to explained them about the importance of continuously report in a regular basis the data collected: Recording, accurate reporting, filling logbooks and sending of data collected to NFA. The education awareness also will inform Lobster operators that FIA PNG office is the certificate holder with the responsibility of oversees the fishery improvement and reporting, having said that, FIA PNG office, also shall receive the data collected when it comes to landed lobster. These programs will be revised, will be established for any Captain/Sea based operations manager, and/ or Lobster operations, annually assessment of outcomes to increase awareness about fees and non-compliance. Awareness on License conditions and Management Plan to emphasize timely catch and effort data collection and submissions/reporting. Introduce and provide all the forms and types of data collection forms for submission. Clipboards to place on board to informed Captains/ Sea based operations Manager and Lobster operations – Logbook process and frequency of reporting Issue updated copies of License Conditions to each fishing vessels including copies of TRL Fishery Management Plan PPT training material for workshop – awareness – NFA requirements Workshops (list of attendances, photos, workshop content) NFA legislation for compliance and penalty's fees. A plan for awareness, training, monitoring, and implementation level per company and their divers.
	Surveillance (YEAR 2)	: Milestone Year 2:
Milestone Year 2		be presented to demonstrate that vessel owners and captains have relevant regulations (including that on fishing logbook) and that red as a result.

Client Action Plan	Activities: Expected outcome:	 Continue collaboration between Captains, operations managers and NFA enforcement department, detection, follow up and sanction options already in place. Development of a document or agreement to be signed by parties (Sea based-Operations Manager, lobster operators and NFA) on appropriated enforcement and sanctions for non-compliance efforts respecting regular logbook reporting and data collection; including the commitment to support the MSC fishery standard requirements and the NFA fishery management plan and penalties. Monitoring results of the forts year of implementation from NFA compliance department – report. On-going enforcement efforts and improvements achieved will be presented to the CAB at the annual surveillance audit. Reviewing the license conditions and ensure it captures updated and new information or developments in the fishery. Signed agreements by Captains, and Lobster's operators (NFA and/or FIA) NFA Compliance report, that vessel owners and captains have been informed of the relevant regulations (including that on fishing logbook) and that compliance is improved as a result. FIA PNG annual Lobster volumes control report Updated license conditions provided A report year # 2 of implementation level of the NFA recommendation for reporting data
Milestone Year 3	Surveillance (YEAR 3): Milestone Year 3: A compliance report be presented to demonstrate that vessel owners and captains have been informed of the relevant regulations (including that on fishing logbook) and as a result, compliance is significantly improved from the previous years. Expected score: 70	
Client Action Plan	Activities: Expected outcome:	Continuous evidence collection that agreed sanctions are being implemented. On-going at- sea enforcement efforts against non- compliance control. Coordination and control both at Sea and landing sites in reporting and sending information. On- going consultation to discuss reporting process improvement (paper base or electronic) of monitoring, sanctions and practice. On-going data collection and reporting for compliance. • NFA Compliance report updated, that vessel owners and captains have been informed of the relevant regulations (including that on fishing logbook) and that compliance is improved as a result.

		 Sanctions raised (non-compliance) in the previous years for non-compliance. Stakeholder and TWG meetings (emails, minutes, photos) FIA PNG annual Lobster volumes control report A documented report year # 3 comparing implementation level NFA, TWG and FIA
Milestone Year 4	regulations (including	: Milestone Year 4: nee report should be produced to show that compliance with reporting g completion and maintenance of logbooks) is significantly improved, evidence of systematic non-compliance.
Client Action Plan	Activities:	NFA, TWG and FIA will evaluate compliance and enforcement plan, including three-year assessment and data indicators of recording and reporting. NFA and/ or FIA comparison assessment shows improvement compared to baseline data establish in certification year (2023) and possible no non-compliance in the last years (2027) A robust awareness system in place that include NFA monitoring program, officers responsible, frequency of monitoring, data collection sheet or electronic reports, and logbook information submitting to NFA and FIA PNG offices
	Expected outcome:	 A comprehensive report comparing the monitoring, recording and reporting (logbook) in the certification period, including sanctions (non-compliance) to be shared with the Certification assessment body (CAB) A target in level (monitoring, recording and reporting) is expected with a significant increase of compliance on NFA reporting regulations Update signed agreement among parties involved NFA, FIA PNG, and TWG
Consultation on condition		

Performance Indicator	PI 3.2.4 (Scoring issue b) Internal and/or external review, PNG System		
Score	70		
Justification	Error! Reference source not found.		
	PNG does not have a formal system to conduct regular internal reviews of its fishery-specific management system. Nevertheless, there are legal obligations – as mandated by the Fisheries Management Act 1988 and the TRL Fishery Management Plan- requiring the review of key parts of its management systems. During the field audit, we learned that the review of the parts of the management system, such as the fishery management plan is determined by the Fishery Manager in charge. Currently, the TRL Fishery Management Plan, for example, is being reviewed after a long while, that involves close consultations with the stakeholders. The current manager in charge has seen the urgent need to equally accommodate the new interest from industry/investors to get involved in the fishery that is currently not well captured in the management plan.		
Condition	By the fourth surveillance audit, evidence provided to show that the fishery-specific management system has functioning review mechanisms in place and its management system is subject to internal and external reviews.		
Condition start	Immediately after the certificate is granted.		
Condition deadline	Fourth surveillance audit		
Verification with other entities	N/A		
Milestone Year 1	Surveillance (YEAR 1): Milestone Year 1:		
	Evidence that a process to have the review mechanism in place within the management system is provided. Expected score: 70		
Client Action Plan	Activities:	Mapping the stakeholders of the TSR Lobster involved in this fishery and developed a list of them.	
		Consultation with local stakeholders in order to determine and agree in information to be reviewed in annual basis by the internal management system team.	
		Assigned a TSR Lobster fishery management team for reviewing internal fishery management plan and write the outcomes.	
		Write a procedure for a formal management review including topics to be reviewed, frequency, scope, and methodology.	

Condition 3-3 PI 3.2.4 – Monitoring & management performance evaluation

		NFA will review the external organizations and frequency of reviewing the fishery management plan in order to formalise the process in a procedure and engaging all parties.	
	Expected outcome:	A plan for the coming 5 years to implement the mechanism described below:	
		Mechanism in place: procedure that describe the fishery management plan review both internal and external, including scope, responsible, methodology, and frequency.	
		Meeting minutes of meeting with stakeholders.	
		NFA draft of the fishery management plan review	
		NFA, TWG and FIA PNG	
	Surveillance (YEAR 2): Milestone Year 2:		
Milestone Year 2	Evidence demonstrated that the process to establish review mechanism within the management system is advanced and supported by stakeholders.		
	Expected score: 70		
Client Action Plan	Activities:	MoU or agreement with parties to commit and support the fishery management plan review, frequency and reporting.	
		Initial draft of the internal and external fishery management review, based on stakeholder feedback taking by emails or meetings.	
	Expected outcome:	 Signed MoU of stakeholders Draft of the internal and externa fishery management plan and outcomes 	
		 A documented list of operators engaged. It is also included an analysis how our initial plan is implemented in the year # 1 after the initial creation. 	
		NFA, TWG and FIA PNG	
	Surveillance (YEAR 3): Milestone Year 3:		
Milestone Year 3	Evidence be presented to demonstrate that the review mechanism is supported (institutionalized), and functioning within the fishery-specific management system.		
	Expected score: 70		
Client Action Plan	Activities:	Proposal to NFA to implement the Fishery management plan as part of the updated fisheries management Act 1998 and prepare a draft for gazzetta publication.	
	Expected outcome:	NFA formal proposal of formal implementation as part of the fisheries management Act 1998	

		 A documented proposal plan to be implemented and added in the PNG fishery legislation as a normal procedure for the TS Lobster fishery (fisheries management Act 1998) A report that includes the recommendations and the implementation process of the previous three (3) years
Milestone Year 4	Surveillance (YEAR 4): Milestone Year 4: Evidence provided to show that the fishery-specific management system has a functioning review mechanism in place and its management system is subject to internal and external reviews. Expected score: 85	
Client Action Plan	Activities:	After several years of reviewing and revising the fisheries management plan of TS Lobster, NFA will set up a fishery-specific management system with a review mechanism in place and its management system reviews for internal and external stakeholders. NFA – FIA PNG MOU supporting the MSC certification process and continuous fishery specific management system review
	Expected outcome:	 MoU (supporting letter) from NFA to FIA PNG and Lobster fishery operators supporting the Client Action Plan (CAP) implementation NFA Lobster fishery management plan including the process or procedure of the management plan review. A documented report verifying that the mechanism are in place and working according to the plan set up in year # 1 NFA and FIA PNG
Consultation on condition		